

Draft Minutes Detroit Board of Police Commissioners
Date of Meeting: Thursday, April 2, 2020 – 3:00 PM
Location: Zoom Virtual Meeting Platform

BOPC Chairperson Lisa Carter called the BOPC Board Meeting to order at 3:00 PM (April 2, 2020)

Detroit Board of Police Commissioners' Membership / Attendance	Attend	Not-Attend
Lisa Carter, Chairperson	Yes	
Annie Mae Holt, Vice-Chairperson	Yes	
Willie E. Bell	Yes	
Elizabeth Brooks	Excused	
Darryl D. Brown	Yes	
Shirley A. Burch	Yes	
Willie E. Burton	Yes	
William M. Davis	Yes	
Evette Griffie	Yes	
Jim Holley	Yes	
Quorum (Yes)	7	

The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the Agenda for Thursday, April 2, 2020.

The Board acting in accordance with its rules approved the following Board Minutes: Thursday, March 5, 2020

Chairperson Carter stated, “Good afternoon. I am Police Commissioner Lisa Carter, Chairperson of the Board, and I represent District #6. I will be conducting this afternoon’s virtual meeting. On behalf of the Board, for those in attendance and viewing this meeting on your government cable channel, thank you for joining our meeting.

Commissioner Brooks has asked to be excused from tonight’s meeting. Today, we have invited Chaplain Charles Clark to provide the invocation.

INVOCATION: Chaplain Charles Clark

The Board considered the following Business Items:

- Approval of the Agenda
- **Chairperson Carter** recognized Commissioner Bell. **Commissioner Bell moved** to approve the Board’s Meeting cancellations for March 19, 2020, and March 26, 2020. **Commissioner Griffie** seconded.
Motion: Commissioner Bell **Second:** Commissioner Griffie Discussion.
VOTE: Yes = 6 No = 0 **Motion: APPROVED**
- Approval of Minutes for March 5, 2020
- Introduction of BOPC Staff
- Introduction of Chief of Police and DPD Staff
- Introduction of Elected Officials, VIPs, civic leaders or their representatives

Again, thank you for joining us this afternoon for our Virtual Board Meeting. Given the critical stage of the Coronavirus, the Board will utilize this virtual platform for our weekly business meetings until further notice. Please note a few housekeeping rules before we move on.

To ensure the Board meeting flows smoothly, we have distributed instructions on how to access the Virtual Meeting and how to participate during the Public Comments’ section of the agenda. If you are experiencing technical difficulties, please dial any of the call-in numbers to attend the meeting. And we thank you in advance for your patience. As a reminder, please note the following: participants/attendees can see and hear you, even if you cannot see and hear them. Also, Commissioners, if you would like to make a comment, please raise your hand, and I will acknowledge your request. If you are using a mobile device, please dial *9 to be acknowledged. Later on, I will provide further instructions regarding the Public Comments’ section of our meeting.

Coronavirus (COVID-19) Impacts:

The Coronavirus (COVID-19) Pandemic has had a tremendous impact on each of our lives over the last few weeks. It has posed a significant threat to our public health, but we are strong, we are committed, and we are a team working together to overcome this adversity. I would like to extend our sincerest prayers, support, and condolences to all those affected by this widespread virus.

The Board expresses its condolences to the Detroit Police Department and the families of Captain Jonathan Parnell, Emergency Services Dispatch Operator Shawn Pride, and Detroit Police Chaplain Valerie Parks. These members displayed dedication, commitment, and excellence in meeting the needs of Detroit residents and the law enforcement community. We are truly grateful for their contributions and sacrifices to public safety and to our community. They will truly be missed.

We also extend our deepest sympathy to the family of State Representative Isaac Robinson, Democratic Representative who served Michigan's 4th House District. His service and contributions to Michigan residents were profound, and he will truly be missed.

We also extend our deepest support and prayers to Chief James Craig and his family and the men and women of this Department who were infected by this widespread virus. Chief Craig's visionary leadership and commitment to the residents of the City of Detroit promotes and encourages the same from his Executive Team, including that of Assistant Chief James White. As he runs the day-to-day operations for the Department, Assistant Chief White's leadership and dedication will provide for a smooth continuation of day-to-day operations for the Department and the residents of the City of Detroit. We also continue to thank the men and women of the Department and all first responders who continue to dedicate their lives to serving our community and remaining on the front lines, placing our health and safety first. Everyone, I continue to emphasize that health, safety, and well-being is the number one priority. For everyone's safety, please continue to utilize all health and safety precautions advised by our health authorities and officials. We are depending on each other, and we must win against this fight. Please stay safe, stay prayerful, and save lives."

Chairperson's Report: Chairperson Lisa Carter, stated, "As we do every week, on behalf of the Board, I want to express the Board's concern and support for fallen and injured officers and their families. Officers' safety and citizens' protection are ranked as two of the most important priorities of the Board. Our Board receives a weekly report from the Department listing injured officers and I ask that the Assistant Chief Levalley provide us with any updates during his report.

The Board of Police Commissioners meets every week except for the Thanksgiving and Christmas holiday periods. We meet at Police Headquarters every Thursday at 3:00 p.m. except every 2nd Thursday of the month when we meet in the community at 6:30 p.m. As indicated before, we will hold virtual meetings until further notice.

Under the Detroit City Charter, Article 7, Chapter 8, the Board of Police Commissioners is empowered to provide civilian oversight and supervisory control of the Police Department. Our Board investigates non-criminal citizens' complaints, monitors Department operations, and works with the Mayor and the Chief of Police to establish police policies, rules, and regulations. As an oversight agency, the Board has the broad responsibility to protect the citizens, protect the city of Detroit from frivolous lawsuits, and create policies to enforce strict adherence to Department policies. Additionally, the Board works to eliminate police misconduct, discriminatory police practices, and unnecessary use of force by police. The Board also believes in transparency, community input, and accountability. As a civilian oversight agency, we protect the rights of citizens. Our objective is to increase the quality of life for residents and visitors to Detroit.

Commissioners, there are several important items for your consideration and information in your board packet emailed to you on Tuesday of this week and in your packet today. Today, we have two (2) resolutions honoring Captain Jonathan Parnell (Posthumously) and Corporal Shawana Doeh (Posthumously). At the appropriate time, I will ask for the presentation of the resolutions.

Chief's Report, From the Chief's Office, I am requesting updates on city-wide crime statistics and any other critical issues facing the Police Department. I am also requesting updates on the following:

- the Progress of Chief Craig
- the Department's continued efforts to combat the widespread COVID-19
- the Implementation of Safety Protocol Measures enforced as a result of Ninth Precinct concerns about the virus outbreak at the Police Pancake Breakfast

-Wellness, Sanitary, and Safety Measures implemented throughout the Department, including at Police Headquarters, and all police precincts/commands to guard against the virus (i.e. officers receiving temperature tests at the beginning and end of shifts, PPE Kits, urging continued social distancing, etc.)

-Detroit Detention Center (DDC) new protocol for officer, detainee safety and protection, -the Implementation of new policies as a result of the COVID-19 (i.e. Safety, Anti-discrimination)

-Whether there has been any increase in workplace violence or discriminatory behavior as a result of the COVID-19; and

-Whether any other critical incidents are impacting the Department

Interim Secretary to the Board's Report: Our Interim Board Secretary, Ms. White will provide us with various updates regarding incoming correspondence.

Under Unfinished Business, we must vote on the proposed job descriptions for Secretary to the Board, Executive Manager of Fiscal, and Chief Investigator. I will ask for a vote at the appropriate time.

Also, I want to announce a few reminders: Again, if you would like to make a public comment, please be prepared to complete the Smartsheet form prior to the meeting. If you do not have access to the Smartsheet form, you may dial any of the call-in numbers when I announce the time for Public Comments, and you may dial *9 to be acknowledged. During the public comments' section of the agenda, each speaker will have two (2) minutes to speak. Mr. Brown will acknowledge each speaker. We ask that you remain respectful and professional. Please also note the Board continues to accept citizen's feedback by telephone, email, fax, and mailing and will respond accordingly. The telephone numbers to the Board's Office is (313) 596-1830 and the Office of the Chief Investigator is (313) 596-2499 should you like to file a citizen's complaint regarding alleged police misconduct. At this time, please silence your cell phones, other electronic devices and other background sounds to prevent interrupting the meeting.

Finally, in the spirit of effective communication, please treat each other respectfully and professionally. Commissioners, please be reminded not to speak until you are recognized by the Chairperson and address your comments to issues that are relevant to the agenda. My objective is to run an orderly meeting and conclude within a reasonable time. Thank you."

Resolution: Commissioner Willie E. Bell read the Resolution honoring Captain Jonathan Parnell, Posthumously.

RESOLUTION HONORING

CAPTAIN JONATHAN PARNELL POSTHUMOUSLY

WHEREAS Jonathan D. Parnell was appointed to the Detroit Police Department on August 23, 1989. Upon graduating from the Detroit Metropolitan Police Academy, Officer Parnell began his career at the Twelfth Precinct; and

WHEREAS Officer Parnell's assignments with the Detroit Police Department included the Twelfth Precinct, Tactical Service Section, Special Response Team, and the Narcotics Enforcement Section where he earned the code name "RECON"; and

WHEREAS Officer Parnell displayed tremendous knowledge and leadership skills as a Police Officer and was promoted to the rank of Sergeant on August 23, 1999. As Sergeant, he was reassigned to the Narcotic Enforcement Section, Tactical Service Section, Special Response Team, Armed Robbery Unit, Investigative Operations Department, and Commercial Auto Theft Section. On August 1, 2006 he was promoted to the rank of Lieutenant. He was transferred from the Commercial Auto Theft Section to Major Violators Unit; and

WHEREAS Lieutenant Parnell was promoted to the rank of Captain on June 17, 2019, and was assigned to the Tenth Precinct. He later was assigned to the Homicide Section where he served until he passed away on March 24, 2020; and

WHEREAS Captain Parnell was the deserving recipient of the following awards: Lifesaving Citation and Medal, Chief's Unit Award, two Perfect Attendance Awards, three Chief's Merit Awards, Fireworks Award, both Consent Judgment Awards, the Major League Baseball All-Star Recognition Award, the Rosa Parks Funeral Recognition Award, and the Super Bowl XL Recognition Award, as well as numerous letters of commendation from citizens and superiors; and

WHEREAS Captain Parnell tirelessly served the Detroit Police Department, the citizens of Detroit and its neighboring communities for 30 and half years. He served the Detroit Police Department and the citizens of the City of Detroit with loyalty, professionalism, integrity and dedication, and was widely respected throughout the law enforcement community as the consummate professional.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT

RESOLVED That the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners, speaking on behalf of the citizens of the great City of Detroit recognizes and honors the lifelong contributions and commitment to excellence in public service of Captain Jonathan D. Parnell aka

“RECON”. His display of courage and unwavering community spirit has improved the quality of life for the citizens of Detroit.

We salute you Captain Jonathan D. Parnell for a job well done.

Commissioner Bell moved to accept the resolution of Captain Jonathan D. Parnell. **Commissioner Brown** seconded. Discussion.

Motion: Commissioner Bell **Second:** Commissioner Brown Discussion.

VOTE: Yes = 6 No = 0 **Motion: APPROVED**

Resolution: Vice-Chairperson Holt read the Resolution honoring Corporal Shawana Doeh, Posthumously.

RESOLUTION HONORING CORPORAL SHAWANA DOEH POSTHUMOUSLY

WHEREAS Shawana Doeh was appointed to the Detroit Police Department on July 6, 1998. Upon graduating from the Metropolitan Police Academy, Officer Doeh began her career at the Twelfth Precinct; and

WHEREAS Officer Doeh dutifully served the Twelfth Precinct, Southwestern District, Forfeiture, Eighth Precinct, Grants and Contracts, and the Special Victims Unit. Police Officer Doeh displayed tremendous diligence and aptitude in her assignments. She was promoted to the rank of Corporal on October 18, 2018. On Monday, March 16, 2020, Corporal Shawana Doeh, Badge 112, passed away; and

WHEREAS During her law enforcement career, Corporal Doeh was the deserving recipient of a Chief’s Citation, the Major League Baseball All-Star Recognition Award, the Rosa Parks Funeral Recognition Award, the Super Bowl XL Recognition Award, and numerous letters of commendation from citizens and superiors; and

WHEREAS Corporal Doeh passionately served the Detroit Police Department, and the citizens of Detroit. Her professionalism, commitment to public service, integrity, and dedication were a credit to the Detroit Police Department. She was highly respected by her peers as a consummate professional.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT

RESOLVED That the Detroit Board of Police Commissioners, speaking for the citizens of Detroit and the Detroit Police Department, awards this resolution posthumously in recognition of Corporal Shawana Doeh’s 21 1/2 years of dedicated and diligent public service. Her professionalism, integrity, and standard of commitment to the city of Detroit and its citizens merit our highest regards.

We salute you Corporal Shawana Doeh for a job well done.

Vice-Chairperson Holt moved to accept the resolution of Corporal Shawanna Doeh. **Commissioner Brown** seconded. Discussion.

Motion: Vice Chairperson Holt **Second:** Commissioner Brown Discussion.

VOTE: Yes = 6 No = 0 **Motion: APPROVED**

Chief of Police Report: Chief of Police’s Summary of CompStat Data and other Crime Information/DPD Information: Assistant Chief David Levalley representing Chief of Police James E. Craig:

Assistant Chief Levalley reported on the following items: Chief Craig’s Progress who is recovering well and is anxious to return to work; Officers Critically Injured in the Line of Duty; CompStat Crime and Statistical Data for the reporting period ending April 2, 2020; Department Efforts to combat the spread of COVID-19, and recent critical incidents impacting the Detroit Police Department and the community.

CompStat Data Provided: (See Full Report in Packet)							
Part I Violent Crimes:	Criminal Homicides:	Sexual Assaults:	Aggravated Assaults:	Non-Fatal Shootings:	Robbery:	Carjacking:	Totals:
Totals:	61/23 less than last year	181/37 less than last year	2006/208 more than last year	158/34 more than last year	510/48 more than last year	44/12 more than last year this time	10% Increase in Part I Violent Crimes

Discussion of the impact of the Governor's Executive Order on the DPD and Community over the last two weeks:

- Overall, observed a significant reduction in volume of crimes on a weekly basis (decrease in violent crime and decrease in property crime).
- Calls for Service: DPD averaged approximately 5000 calls for service in the City per week; prior week 4500, current week 4300, observed 10% reduction in calls for service since shelter in place orders.
- Response Time: 11 minutes and 6 seconds for Priority One Calls; still maintaining same average response time.

Coronavirus Impacts (COVID-19) on the DPD Personnel and Patrol Operations:

- As of today at 7 am, 647 members currently in quarantine.
- 524 of those members are sworn; 123 members are civilian.
- 106 members tested positive for Coronavirus.
- Returned 141 members back to work.
- Sixth, Eighth, and Ninth Precincts all averaging 40 people in quarantine.
- Communications Operations: 57 members under quarantine.
- Downtown Services: 31 members under quarantine.

DPD Strategies and Tactics: Continuity of Operations Plan

- Redeploying and reassigning individuals from various units based on emergency priority level to cover priority positions for patrol operations' continuity.
- Identified Order of Succession for Command as well as most essential functions to perform as a law enforcement agency;
- Evaluated each unit to assign level of priorities for determination of essential versus nonessential.
- Mobilization Mode Planning, External Entities (i.e. Michigan State Police) are also part of the Department's Continuity Plan should the level progress; the DPD is not currently in this mode.

Communications Operations:

- Currently, 57 people that are under quarantine.
- Some members within the unit tested positive.
- Discussion of utilizing Communications Backup Center in the case of an emergency, crisis, etc. to avoid service interruption.
- Safe, Sanitary Cleaning Measures implemented at all facilities including Detroit Public Safety Headquarters.
- Additional Telephone System to process non-emergency requests for service; all police precincts are still open especially for life-threatening emergencies.

Detroit Detention Center (DDC) Protocol:

- Screening procedures involving temperature monitoring conducted by Nursing Staff;
- Quarantine Area to prevent further spread;
- Interrogation Process Updated in Specialized Areas
- Electronic Submission of Warrants to the Wayne County Prosecutor's Office

Further Safety Measures:

- Elimination of all face-to-face meetings; implementation of daily virtual meetings.
- Daily Temperatures and Questionnaires given to members as they arrive on and depart duty;
- PPE (Personal Protection Equipment) kits in every car which includes a full gown, mask, gloves, and sanitizer; issuance of surgical masks
- Implementation of Stand-Up Roll Calls for safety precautions.
- Social Distancing Guidelines throughout precincts.

- Partnership and Agreement between DPD, Detroit Fire Department and Greektown Hotel to accommodate first responders to mitigate spread of COVID-19.
- Providing meals for DPD Members at precincts;
- Ensuring time and pay measures are implemented to ensure members are covered during COVID-19.
- Rapid Response Testing where officers will receive response within minutes of testing.
- Non-Essential Businesses and the Governor's Orders: DPD has not been enforcing this measure; Officers have written tickets, but the DPD has used sparingly and still encourages citizens to follow guidelines.
- No Traffic Stops should be conducted inquiring about whereabouts or destinations.
- Discussed further challenges and lessons learned.

Commissioner Burch inquired about whether the DPD has a facility within each precinct to allow for safety and hygiene measures for members. **Commissioner Burch** also extended get-well wishes to Chief of Police James E. Craig and volunteered to receive updates from the Department for distribution to the Board. **Chairperson Carter** shared correspondence and notification protocol. **Commissioner Brown** thanked Assistant Chief Levalley, the Department, and all first responders and offered condolences to the Chaplain Corps for the loss of Chaplain Valerie Parks. **Commissioner Brown** also inquired about the Hazardous Duty Pay Initiatives and Quarantining of Department Members. **Commissioner Brown** referenced the Massachusetts' State Legislation regarding covering time off for law enforcement officers who are off sick. **Commissioner Brown** requested sharing the Hazard Duty Pay Initiatives' information with Governor Gretchen Whitmer and Mayor Michael Duggan. **Commissioner Brown** also inquired about the Department's Decontamination Protocol for cleaning patrol vehicles. **Vice-Chairperson Holt** thanked Assistant Chief Levalley for his thorough report and discussed the activities that took place at Rouge Park. **Chairperson Carter** thanked Assistant Chief Levalley, the Department, and Chief of Police Craig for their continued work and offered the Board's support and prayers during this time.

Report from Interim Board Secretary/Communications Submitted to BOPC as incoming information: Ms. White reported on the following items:

1. DPD Facial Recognition Report #20, #21, and #22
2. DPD Submission – Request for Change of Duty Status to Administrative Leave Without Pay But With Medical Benefits for Police Officer Stanley Saunders, Badge 3660, Ninth Precinct
3. DPD Manual Directive Property Control 306.3
4. FOIA Request dated March 13, 2020, from Rodd Monts ACLU
5. DPD Manual Directive 301.3 Telephone Crime Reporting
6. Project GreenLight Update dated 4/1/2020
7. Updates on the BOPC and OCI Staff

Unfinished Business: Job Descriptions' Language: Secretary to the Board, Chief Investigator, and Executive Manager of Fiscal: **Chairperson Carter** requested the Board to consider and approve the language for the above-mentioned job postings, including the position of Chief Investigator.

Chairperson Carter recognized Commissioner Brown and Commissioner Bell respectively. **Commissioner Brown** and **Commissioner Bell** requested final editing of the Chief Investigator's job specifications before the Board's final approval. **Chairperson Carter** confirmed same. **Chairperson Carter** also reminded the Board of the requirement to approve the out-of-class pay for Interim Chief Investigator Lawrence Akbar and requested business item placement on a future Board Agenda.

Chairperson Carter recognized Commissioner Bell. **Commissioner Bell** moved to reschedule all virtual Board meetings to 3:00 p.m. until further notice. **Commissioner Brown** seconded. Discussion.

Motion: Vice-Chairperson Holt **Second:** Commissioner Brown Discussion.

VOTE: Yes = 6 No = 0 **Motion: APPROVED**

New Business: **Chairperson Carter** recognized Commissioner Bell. **Commissioner Bell** offered support and condolences on the recent passing of retired DPD Officer and Legendary Historic Figure Moses Baldwin, who recently celebrated his 90th birthday on March 6, 2020. **Chairperson Carter** recognized Commissioner Burch. **Commissioner Burch** requested whether upcoming resolution recipients would receive notification of the Board's updated virtual meeting times.

Announcements: Chairperson Carter announced the following:

- A. **Next Meeting:** Thursday, April 9, 2020, at 3:00 p.m., BOPC Virtual Meeting
- B. **Next Community Meeting:** Thursday, May 14, 2020, at 3:00 p.m., BOPC Virtual Meeting

Oral Communications/Public Comments:

Chairperson Carter recognized Commissioner Bell. **Commissioner Bell** commended Chairperson Carter and BOPC Administrative Staff on work and contributions during this time. **Ms. Michelle George** discussed health measures and mentioned other early warning signs of the coronavirus. **Ms. George** also inquired about whether the Medical Marihuana Dispensaries were considered essential. **Ms. Rumi Weaver** inquired about the measures the Board will ensure against any abuses of power regarding the Department's activities. **Chairperson Carter** recognized Commissioner Brown. **Commissioner Brown** emphasized the Board's continued Oversight of the Department and Citizen Complaint Process. **Mr. Scotty Bowman** expressed discontent with "continued violations of the City Charter" regarding the cancellation of two (2) Board meetings in a row; requested information on the status of Corporal Dewayne Jones's promotion; and noted concerns about the Department's activities as a result of the Governor's recent mandates. **Ms. Tawanna Petty** submitted condolences on the Department's (2) two recent losses and requested the Board to ensure the public distribution of the Facial Recognition Technology Reports for review and analysis. **Chairperson Carter** and Interim Board Secretary White noted the Board's previous activities on the distribution of all Facial Recognition Technology Reports. **Ms. Brenda Hill** asked about whether persons taken or released from custody are tested for COVID-19 and whether this information is shared with the people that they come into contact. She also asked about measures and policies on dispersing persons who remain at public parks during the hot weather and Summer months. **Ms. Hill** also asked about the Department's activities relating to the special population of homeless persons, and the impact of criminal statistics during the Stay-At Home Mandate. **Ms. Yana Lynn** requested information on the Department's efforts to protect citizens who are in contact with law enforcement officers, protective gear that detainees are provided, and minimizing non-violent arrests. **Ms. Lynn** also expressed concerns with ticketing while gathering.

Adjournment:

Chairperson Carter recognized Commissioner Bell. **Commissioner Bell** moved for adjournment. **Vice-Chairperson Holt** seconded. Discussion. **Results:** Motion Approved.

VOTE: **Yes = 7** **No = 0** **Motion: APPROVED**

Chairperson Carter adjourned the meeting at 4:52 pm.